



August 20, 1999

Mr. Lou Bright
General Counsel
Texas Alcoholic Beverage Commission
P.O. Box 13127
Austin, Texas 78711-3127

OR99-2369

Dear Mr. Bright:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 128254.

The Texas Alcoholic Beverage Commission (the "commission") received a request for information related to a certain fatality automobile accident. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

First, you seek to withhold an autopsy report. The Public Information Act's exceptions do not, as a general rule, apply to information made public by other statutes. Open Records Decision No. 525 (1989). Section 11, article 49.25 of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides as follows:

The medical examiner shall keep full and complete records properly indexed, giving the name if known of every person whose death is investigated, the place where the body was found, the date, the cause and manner of death, and shall issue a death certificate. The full report and detailed findings of the autopsy, if any, shall promptly be delivered to the proper district, county, or criminal district attorney in any case where further investigation is advisable. Such records shall be public records.

Code Crim. Proc. art. 49.25, § 11. Autopsy reports prepared by a medical examiner are expressly made public by the Code of Criminal Procedure. Code Crim. Proc. art. 49.25, § 11. Therefore, you must release the autopsy report to the requestor.

Second, you seek to withhold an accident report form that appears to have been completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Access to accident reports is governed by law other than the Public Information Act. The Seventy-fifth Legislature repealed V.T.C.S. article 6701d and amended section 550.065 of the Transportation Code concerning the disclosure of accident report information. Act of May 29, 1997, 75th Leg., R.S., ch. 1187, 1997 Tex. Gen. Laws 4575, 4582-4583 (to be codified at Transp. Code § 550.065). However, a Travis County district court has issued a temporary injunction enjoining the enforcement of the amendment to section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. *Texas Daily Newspaper Ass'n v. Morales*, No. 97-08930 (345th Dist. Ct., Travis County, Tex., Oct. 24, 1997) (second amended agreed temporary injunction). A temporary injunction preserves the status quo until the final hearing of a case on its merits. *Janus Films, Inc. v. City of Fort Worth*, 358 S.W.2d 589 (1962). The supreme court has defined the status quo as "the last, actual peaceable, non-contested status that preceded the pending controversy." *Texas v. Southwestern Bell Tel. Co.*, 526 S.W.2d 526, 528 (Tex. 1975). The status quo of accident report information prior to the enactment of S.B. 1069 is governed by section 47 of article 6701d, V.T.C.S.¹

Section 47(b)(1) provides that:

The Department or a law enforcement agency employing a peace officer who made an accident report *is required to release a copy of the report* on request to:

. . . .

(D) a person who provides the Department or the law enforcement agency with two or more of the following:

- (i) the date of the accident;
- (ii) the name of any person involved in the accident; or
- (iii) the specific location of the accident

¹Although the Seventy-fourth Legislature repealed and codified article 6701d as part of the Transportation Code, the legislature did not intend a substantive change of the law but merely a recodification of existing law. Act of May 1, 1995, 74th Leg., R.S., ch. 165, §§ 24, 25, 1995 Tex. Gen. Laws 1025, 1870-71. Furthermore, the Seventy-fourth Legislature, without reference to the repeal and codification of V.T.C.S. article 6701d, amended section 47 of article 6701d, V.T.C.S., relating to the disclosure of accident reports. Act of May 27, 1995, 74th Leg., R.S., ch. 894, § 1, 1995 Tex. Gen. Laws 4413, 4414. Because the repeal of a statute by a code does not affect an amendment of the statute by the same legislature which enacted the code, the amendment is preserved and given effect as part of the code provision. Gov't Code § 311.031(c). Thus, the amendment of section 47 of article 6701d, V.T.C.S. is the existing law regarding the availability of accident report information, and may be found following section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. *See also* Act of May 27, 1995, 74th Leg., R.S., ch. 894, § 1, 1995 Tex. Gen. Laws 4413, 4414.

V.T.C.S. art. 6701d, § 47(b)(1) (emphasis added). Under this provision, a law enforcement agency “is required to release” a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the law enforcement agency with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In the situation at hand, the requestor has provided the commission with at least two pieces of information specified by the statute. Thus, you are required to release the accident report under section 47(b)(1)(D) of article 6701d, V.T.C.S.

As for the remainder of the documents, section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code provides:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]

Gov’t Code § 552.108. Generally, a governmental body claiming an exception under section 552.108 must reasonably explain, if the information does not supply the explanation on its face, how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(b)(1); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You have submitted a letter from the prosecuting district attorney’s office explaining that the requested information concerns an instance that is currently being prosecuted.

We find that you have shown that the release of the requested information would interfere with the detection, investigation or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.--Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases); Open Records Decision No. 216 (1978). We therefore conclude that section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts the requested records, excluding the autopsy and accident reports, from required public disclosure.

Finally, we note that information normally found on the front page of an offense report is generally considered public. *Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.--Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976); Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976). Thus, you must release the type of information that is considered to be front page offense report information, even if this information is not actually located on the front page of the offense report. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c); *see* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing the types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). You indicate that you have previously released basic offense report information with respect to the offense of “Making Alcoholic Beverages Available to Minors.” You indicate that with respect to this report, you seek to withhold driver’s license numbers and social security numbers included on this report.

Because these types of information are not usually considered basic offense report information, you may withhold the redacted information.

However, you also seek to withhold an offense report concerning the charge of manslaughter. Basic information may not be withheld from public disclosure under section 552.108 or 552.103. Open Records Decision No. 362 (1983). Accordingly, we conclude that you must release the basic offense report information contained in this offense report.

We are resolving this matter with an informal letter ruling rather than with a published open records decision. This ruling is limited to the particular records at issue under the facts presented to us in this request and should not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records. If you have questions about this ruling, please contact our office.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Sue M. Lee", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Sue M. Lee
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SML\nc

Ref: ID# 128254

encl: Submitted documents

cc: Mr. Claude D. Ducloux
Hill, Ducloux, Carnes & Clark
400 West 15th Street, Suite 750
Austin, Texas 78701
(w/o enclosures)